

# Nessie or not Nessie ?

## Minutes of the meeting – Part three

**Date:** 10<sup>th</sup> January 2007

**Chairman:** Thibault

**Present:** Laure, Marie-Alice, Thomas, Raphaël, Loïc

After a description of what will be developed during the meeting, each participant introduced himself.

Then, we noticed that we were forgetting the introduction of the main character: the Loch Ness monster, also called Nessie. Loïc (a very old inhabitant of Loch Ness) told us what he knows about it. He talked about his encounter with Nessie, described "this huge animal with a long neck". Then Laure (a paleontologist) told us that it can be compared with a plesiosaurus, a dinosaur with a long neck which lived 70 million years ago.

After this brief comparison, Laure said to us that a plesiosaurus cannot live in the Loch Ness. There are too many contradictions. A plesiosaurus wouldn't be capable of feeding itself in such a lake for example. She finally said that the sonar contacts didn't prove anything, but Marie-Alice (a naval officer) strongly disagreed. She knows many successful explorations.

Loïc insists on the value of his witnessing. He saw Nessie quite well, "the alcohol in his veins didn't perturb his sight".

Thomas (a Japanese tourist) agrees, he saw many photographs on the Internet on which Nessie appears. But Raphaël (a special effects technician) jumped out of his chair and said "they are all fakes!". Marie-Alice decided to show one but Raphaël explained us why it can't be a real monster.

Then Loïc told him that he is more reliable than photos. Marie-Alice approved. For Raphaël, making false photographs is only a way to make money.

This moved the debate to the next point: Nessie as a way to promote the Loch Ness. Loïc started by saying that he told his story many times to tourists but it didn't cost him more than a glass of whiskey. He doesn't want to exploit it to make a living. Thomas added that everybody knows the legend, and even if they some people do not believe in it, it enables them to discover the beautiful landscape of Scotland. Then we wondered why this legend keep on if it would be a hoax. Raphaël answered by telling us the Channel Five experiment: they put a puppet in the lake and noticed that many tourists believed this to be the real Nessie and took photos. For him, this type of event lets the story to continue.

Then Loïc said that Nessie is not a dinosaur or a monster for them, it is the "spirit of the lake". Laure added that they didn't find irrefutable evidence to prove the existence or the non-existence of Nessie, so the scientists cannot conclude for the moment. Thomas agrees and conclude by telling us that the authorities preserve the environment of this region with the money they earn with Nessie. Consequently, there are only advantages to believe in it.

We ended with a vote. Three participants out of five think Nessie exists, and **every participant thinks that believe in it is a good thing.**

Thank you for your involvement!